



Quarterly Report
GLOBAL CIVIL-MILITARY RELATIONS PROGRAM
USAID Cooperative Agreement No. AEP-A-00-98-0014-00
July 1 to September 30, 2000

I. SUMMARY

During this quarter, the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) continued developing the Partnership for Democratic Governance and Security (PDGS), a global information and education service. At the beginning of the quarter, NDI worked with one of its PDGS partners, Center for Civil-Military Relations, to provide training sessions to Georgian government officials and educators on developing curricula for teaching civil-military relations in Georgia. In the latter part of July and early part of August, the new Senior Advisor for Global Civil-Military Relations, Dr. Eva Busza, traveled to South-East Asia and conducted consultations on civil-military relations. During this trip, she met with NDI's Indonesian partners and with the help of NDI's Indonesian Governance and Security Team, updated them on NDI programs around the world. She also sought input from the Indonesians on the type of assistance and programs they would find useful in the future. In the latter part of the quarter NDI conducted an intensive review of the PDGS and its work to date. This review led NDI to reorient some of the activities of the PDGS in order to ensure that the goals of the Cooperative Agreement are met. In the last week of September, Dr. Busza participated as a commentator and moderator in a conference co-sponsored by NDI titled "The Politics of Military Extrication--Lessons for Cuba."

II. BACKGROUND

In many cases, transitions to democratic rule have been complicated by a legacy of military influence in domestic political affairs, which has left newly elected leaders with neither the expertise nor the institutional mechanisms necessary to ensure civilian control of the armed forces. Good examples of this problem were seen in the Eastern European transition and are currently a problem in countries like Indonesia and Malaysia. Some promising new democracies have had their political development slowed or reversed by military intervention. As new democracies move beyond landmark first or second elections, issues, such as civilian-military relations, require attention to ensure continued democratic advances.

In July 1998, the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) entered into a Cooperative Agreement with the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to create a Partnership for Democratic Governance and Security (PDGS)-- an information, education, and development alliance to promote and support democratic governance through bolstering the capacity of civilian institutions to establish and strengthen their leadership, management and oversight of their military forces.

The PDGS brings together five “Contributing Partners:” NDI, the *Center for Civil-Military Relations* at the *Monterey Naval Post-Graduate School* (CCMR), *The Institute for Security and Development Studies*, Manila (ISDS); *Seguridad Estrategica Regional para el 2000* in Buenos Aires (SER), and the *Universidad Torcuato di Tella*, Buenos Aires (UTDT).

With direction from NDI, each partner engages in activities designed to secure the core goal of improving the capacity of civilian institutions within emerging democracies to provide the requisite leadership, direction, management and oversight of their military forces.

PDGS programs are created and conducted with the cooperation of national legislatures, political parties, civic organizations, academic institutions, the media and the civilian elements of the defense establishment belonging to newly emerging democracies. They consist of the following four core activities:

- The publication of a series of practical resource documents for defense policy-makers in the defense policy-making community of newly emerging democracies-- government officials, legislators, journalists, civic activists, academics and military officials.
- The development of a web-based governance and security clearinghouse that will provide a database of laws and constitutional provisions related to defense oversight, policy directives, “white papers,” case studies and civil-military publications that can be easily accessed by policy makers in democratizing states.
- The development of an educational module or collection of lessons learned on how to establish and strengthen civilian capacity in military oversight and defense policy-making through the use of democratic processes and procedures.
- The provision of workshops, consultations and programs dealing with the various aspects of establishing and strengthening a functional system of democratic civilian control of the armed forces. These activities are country-specific or cross-regional requests from governments, political parties, civic groups, journalists and universities.

III. PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Partnership Activities

Center for Civil-Military Relations (CCMR)

For PDGS, CCMR's responsibilities include: collecting information materials for the Governance and Security online clearinghouse; writing resource papers and case studies; drafting an assessment framework; and advising UTDT with curriculum development.

During this quarter, CCMR and NDI conducted a joint program in Georgia from July 10 to 14, 2000 to help Georgians develop, conduct and manage education and research programs in civil-military relations. This first ever USAID-DOD civil-military program drew on CCMR's experience in implementing Expanded International Military Education (E-IMET) programs globally and NDI's expertise in providing training to legislators, the media, journalists, think-tanks and NGOs. The initiative was launched with a seminar on "education in democratic civil-military relations," a program designed to provide technical assistance to government and military officials and members of civil society in order to help them develop curricula for teaching civil-military relations in Georgia. NDI and CCMR coordinated this effort with Giorgi Margelashvili of the Institute for Public Administration, Defense and Security Committee of the Parliament of Georgia (GIPA) and David Darchiashvili of the Center for Civil-Military Relations and Security Studies (CCMRSS), an organization that falls within a larger umbrella NGO, the Caucasian Institute for Peace and Democracy and Development (CIPDD).

Prior to this initiative, CCMR had already conducted two programs in Georgia—in September 1998 it held a workshop on civil-military issues in Tbilisi and in August 1999 it arranged for representatives of the Georgian Center for Civil-Military Relations and Security Studies to visit the Monterey Naval Post-Graduate School.

The CCMR-NDI seminar held in July 2000 had the following basic objectives:

- To review the challenges associated with the overall task of introducing civil-military relations by highlighting different experiences.
- To review existing capabilities in Georgia for conducting such education.
- To review the curricula to be presented by the Georgian institutions.

The seminar was held in the Georgian parliament buildings and brought together 25 people from a variety of government ministries (Defense, the general staff, foreign ministry), the parliament, educational institutes and the NGO community.

NDI sent trainer Marcela Donadio from Ser en el 2000 to give a presentation: on non-academic approaches to teaching civil-military relations and another on research

methods for civil-military relations: understanding different audiences. In the presentation Donadio discussed the development of civil-military relations in the Philippines and Argentina, focusing on the importance of civil society's emergence in post-authoritarian times. Using the institutional history of ISDS and SER, she described different phases in the creation of an NGO and provided analysis and suggestions on how an NGO can develop its teaching tools and maintain its activity in the security field. Donadio's second presentation discussed the variety of ways in which an NGO can communicate with different audiences, according to the audience's specific characteristics. During this session, much time was devoted to exploring the NGO-government relationship and the responsibilities of both.

During this quarter, CCMR also made progress on writing its case studies. Following the receipt of feedback from NDI on previously written drafts, CCMR sent the following second drafts for comment:

- "Intelligence In New Democracies: The Challenge of Civilian Control"
- "Guatemala: Lessons Learned and Future Challenges"
- "Mozambique: Lessons Learned and Future Challenges"
- "The Military Role in Internal Defense and Security: Some Problems")

NDI is still waiting for revised versions of:

- "Image of the Wehrmacht in Federal German Society"
- Civil-Military Relations in Indonesia: Reformasi and Beyond"

In this quarter, CCMR also completed first drafts of the following papers:

- "The Role of the Media in Achieving Democratic, Civilian Control of the Military in Emerging Democracies"
- "Lessons learned from the Brazilian Experience"
- "Lessons learned from the Spanish Experience"

The Institute for Strategic and Development Studies (ISDS)

ISDS's responsibilities in the PDGS include writing resource papers and assisting in gathering materials for the PDGS web site.

During this quarter, ISDS submitted a first draft of Lessons Learned from the Taiwanese Case.

ISDS collected and added a number of government documents from the Philippines to the PDGS web site. It also did a brief press search of articles from the Philippine Daily Inquirer and selected English language newspapers on the Philippine army and provided bibliographical citations.

SER en el 2000 (SER)

According to the Cooperative Agreement, SER en el 2000's key responsibility is to design and maintain the PDGS web site (www.pdgs.org.ar or www.pdgs.org) and online clearinghouse.

During this quarter, SER continued to update the web site with materials sent by PDGS partners, as well as monitor the statistics of those who navigate the site. It continued the process of reserving and registering the pdgs.org domain name and subscribing the site on several search engines.

To date, 337 documents have been entered into the PDGS database. As a consequence of growing volumes of materials (total number of pages in the database is 1240), SER began work in this quarter on establishing a new type of search that would facilitate the location of materials.

Finally, SER continued to coordinate the Forum for Debate, an electronic mailing list that is used as a vehicle for discussion by users. The Forum provides an opportunity for various institutions and organizations in the western hemisphere to discuss civil-military issues from a regional perspective.

Universidad Torcuato di Tella

Upon entering the partnership, UTDT originally assumed chief responsibility for developing a national security affairs curriculum based on work it had initiated with a Ford Foundation grant. UTDT committed to developing a one-week training program on national defense issues for civilian leaders that would include a syllabus, a participant handbook, criteria for selecting participants, a participation evaluation, a simulation exercise, a follow-up program for trainers and participants, and administrative requirements. UTDT also committed to developing two training modules. The first module was intended to be a one-day workshop designed for journalists and NGOs, while the second module was expected to be a two-day workshop to train new trainers for civil-military programs. These education modules would then be tested in three countries: Argentina in 1998, Nicaragua in 1999, and Senegal in 2000. Following these pilot programs, the courses were to be offered to other universities and NGOs globally. CCMR was to provide substantive advice on developing these training materials and on implementing the programs.

In this quarter, NDI received the following two draft documents from UTDT:

- “Training Civilians About Security Issues”
- “The Role of the Argentine Congress in Defense and Security Policies”

To date, UTDT has not made any progress on developing the one-week curriculum or training modules. As a consequence, NDI has initiated an investigation into UTDT's contribution to the partnership.

National Democratic Institute

Staffing

In this quarter, there was a complete turnover in the managing staff of NDI's civil-military program. In May, Major General William Nash, the director of NDI's global civil-military programs, took a leave of absence, at the request of Secretary of State Madeleine Albright, in order to accept a position with the United Nations in Kosovo. The PDGS program was administrated in May and June by Program Officer Susan Kupperstein, who then left the program at the end of July to pursue a Ph.D. Dr. Eva Busza, an assistant professor at the College of William and Mary, was hired in late July to become the senior advisor for NDI's global civil-military programs. In early September, Program Assistant Saadia Ghani joined the team, replacing Susan Kupperstein.

Program Management and Review of the PDGS

NDI began this quarter by giving extensive feedback on all of the case studies and resource papers submitted by CCMR and ISDS to date. It then conducted an extensive internal review of PDGS activities. As a consequence of this review and after consulting with USAID representatives, NDI made plans to redirect some of the work of the PDGS in subsequent quarters. These are discussed below under the Future Activities section.

Civil-Military Trainers

This quarter NDI updated and expanded its web of civil-military experts who are interested in making themselves available to legislative staff, military officials and political leaders from emerging democracies. NDI's Civil-Military Relations Program sent questionnaires to potential civil-military experts who were associated with NDI in the past. The questionnaires will separate the experts by regions and areas of interest. NDI hopes that these experts will provide a readily available resource for civil-military training. Most importantly, many of these experts have offered to act as on-line resources serving as a point of contact for PDGS web site users.

Indonesia Programs

In August 1999, USAID's Office of Transition Initiatives provided NDI with additional incremental funding to the PDGS Annual Work plan to conduct a year-long program designed to improve civil-military relations in Indonesia. More specifically, the program consists of training on defense-related issues for the legislature and the media; offering expert consultations on civil-military; building the capacity of academic institutions and think tanks to research and analyze security policy and the institutions of the military; and sponsoring dialogues between civilian and military leaders.

During this quarter NDI's programs in governance and security in Indonesia centered around five main initiatives. First, in response to requests from members of the legislative committee that deals with security issues (DPR Commission I) and the legislature's center for research and information, NDI compiled information on states of

emergency provisions in countries around the world. Focusing specifically on seven countries (France, India, Paraguay, Peru, South Africa, Great Britain and the United States), NDI discussed potential constitutional provisions and legislation pertaining to states of emergency and highlighted various strategies for the members of the legislature.

Second, in response to complaints from legislators that they did not have adequate resources and expertise to use their legislative initiative to shape defense policy, NDI began to explore the possibility of creating a team of civilian security experts and lawyers who would assist members on DPR Commission I draft security and defense legislature. The core members of this group would come from the Aksara Foundation, an independent security think-tank.

Third, NDI began to organize a second journalist professional development program on civil-military relations, which will be held next quarter. The program follows the model used in a pilot program conducted by NDI in April and May 2000. Journalists will be brought to Jakarta to participate in a three-day workshop where they will discuss civil-military and media-military relations in democracy and in Indonesia, receive a technical primer on the *Tentara Nasional Indonesia*-Indonesia National Military- (TNI)-and its activities, and engage in training workshops on journalists' skills and standards in security reporting. Participants will then return to their hometown newspapers and write on security issues. During this time they will receive input from NDI on their stories. At the end of next quarter they will reconvene in Indonesia and share their experiences with other journalists in the program.

Fourth, NDI continued its work assisting Gadjah Mada University and the University of Indonesia (UI) in revising their national securities studies curriculum known as the "National Resilience Studies." NDI began a series of workshops on curriculum planning and revision that it will continue next quarter.

Finally, NDI's programs in governance and security in Indonesia invited Dr. Eva Busza to consult with a wide spectrum of the Indonesian security community on civil-military relations and within that context, future democracy assistance that NDI might provide to the Indonesians. Dr. Busza consulted with minister of defense, minister of education, the National Resilience Institute, active military officers, leading Indonesia experts on the military, the media and domestic nongovernment organizations.

[For more information on NDI's OTI-funded civil-military relations program in Indonesia, please consult the attached quarterly report.]

Africa

During this quarter, NDI continued to assist the creation of a seminar on African civil-military relations. The seminar, sponsored by the Organization of African Unity (OAU) and the United Nations Center for Disarmament, was to be held in Nairobi in the summer or fall of 2000. The Center requested NDI's assistance in designing the program and selecting participants. The goal of the seminar was to produce draft guidelines for an African Code of Conduct for the armed forces that could eventually be ratified by the OAU. This initiative, entitled "The Role of the Military in African Democratic

Transitions: Strengthening Democratic Constitutional Law in Africa,” was to be a follow-up to the previous year’s OAU Resolution, which was designed to condemn and isolate governments that come to power through military coups in Africa. NDI has set aside \$60,000 in funding from the National Endowment for Democracy to support this effort. Unfortunately, matching funds from other donors did not materialize in this quarter. As a consequence, the program is currently on hold.

Latin America and the Caribbean

NDI participated and partly supported a conference on “The Politics of Military Extrication: Lessons for Cuba” co-sponsored by the Center for Free Cuba, a human rights and democracy organization; Georgetown University’s Cuba 21 Project; and Cursos de Arrabida, a Portuguese foundation. Participants in the conference are contributing to an edited volume that will explore democratic transitions in a comparative perspective, focusing specifically on how countries have established civilian control over the armed forces following political change. The volume will be translated into Spanish, and efforts will be made to distribute it throughout the Cuban community with the hope that it will be read by Cuban officers and future policy-makers.

IV. RESULTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

Much of this quarter was devoted to laying the groundwork for more effective programming in the future—thus it is too early to assess what the results of the changes will be.

Cuba--Through its participation in the project on military extrication in Cuba, NDI was able to insert a practical agenda into an otherwise predominantly scholarly conference by providing two civil-military trainers who framed their work in terms of practical lessons that can be relayed to future Cuban policy-makers.

Globally-- There continued to be evidence that the Civil-Military Relations Program is reaching its intended audience (policy-makers in developing democracies) as reflected in individuals signing up to participate in the PDGS forum and contacting PDGS members on various topics. Most recently the program received a request from a Guatemalan policy-maker asking us to send materials on military doctrines and the process by which they are written. The program has invited this official to consult with us on other issues and have indicated that if Guatemalan officials are interested, Dr. Busza would be happy to provide consultations or workshops on democracy and civil-military relations

V. FUTURE ACTIVITIES

During the remaining tenure of the USAID Cooperative Agreement, the PDGS will focus on the following:

Resource Papers and Case Studies

The PDGS will complete the following resource papers and case studies, and they will be available on the PDGS web site:

- “Intelligence In New Democracies: The Challenge of Civilian Control” (CCMR)
- “Guatemala: Lessons Learned and Future Challenges” (CCMR)
- “Mozambique: Lessons Learned and Future Challenges” (CCMR)
- “The Military Role in Internal Defense and Security: Some Problems” (CCMR)
- “Restoring and Strengthening Civilian Control: Best Practices in Civil-Military Relations in the Philippines” (ISDS)
- “Lessons Learned from the Taiwanese Case” (ISDS)
- “Image of the Wehrmacht in Federal German Society” (CCMR)
- “Civil-Military Relations in Indonesia: Reformasi and Beyond” (CCMR)
- “Developing Legislative Expertise in Civil-Military Relations” (CCMR)
- “Structuring Civilian Institutions for More Effective Democratic Oversight of the Military” (CCMR)
- “The Role of the Media in Achieving Democratic, Civilian Control of the Military in Emerging Democracies” (CCMR)
- “Lessons learned from the South Korean Experience” (ISDS)
- “Lessons learned from the Thai Experience” (ISDS)
- “Lessons learned from the Brazilian Experience” (CCMR)
- “Lessons learned from the Spanish Experience” (CCMR)
- “The National Security Framework: What do countries legislate?” (CCMR)
- “Defense Budgets and Civilian Oversight” (CCMR)
- “Political Campaigns, Elections and the Military” (NDI)
- “Emergency Laws and the Role of the Military” (NDI)
- “Defense Committees: Their Role and Function” (CCMR)

The Web-based Governance and Security Clearinghouse

The PDGS will have a user friendly web site that will make available to policymakers, journalists, civil society groups, universities, and individuals a wide array of information and resources on civil-military relations. The web site will serve as a first point of contact, allowing users to follow-up on materials or information they access by contacting country or issue specialists for more information.

Over the next year, NDI’s global civil-military team will be developing a series of short web documents on the following themes:

- democratic governance and civil-military relations
- re-conceptualizing civil-military relations in the post cold-war era
- civilians defining, establishing limits on, and exercising oversight over military expansion

Developing A National Security Affairs Curriculum

The PDGS will complete a one-week training manual for civilians aimed at providing them with information that will help them develop and strengthen their oversight of the armed forces and security policy. The training manual will cover the following lessons:

Day One: Problems of a Democratic Transition—The Civil-Military Relationship (CCMR)

Day Two: The Role of a Military in a Democratic Society (CCMR)

Day Three: What is Democratic Military Professionalism? (CCMR)

Day Four: Mechanisms of Civilian Oversight (NDI)

Day Five: Civilians Managing the Defense Budget (CCMR)

Day Six: Civilians Overseeing Intelligence in a Democratic Society (CCMR)

Day Seven: Civil Society and the Military (ISDS)

Each day's lesson will consist of four parts:

- An outline for a lecture (duration 1 ½ hours)
- A set of discussion questions
- A set of readings
- A simulation or interactive exercise

Country-Specific or Cross-Regional Programming

NDI will continue to draw on the PDGS to support NDI's civil-military program in Indonesia. Over the next year, the NDI staff in cooperation with the G/DG staff will be trying to create openings and attracting funding from both governmental and non-government sources for developing projects in Nigeria, Georgia and elsewhere. Projects in these countries will, however, depend on the availability of funding and support from USAID missions.

Other Activities

The PDGS will hold a partners' meeting in Monterey in March 2001 to finalize the training module and to discuss plans for the future development of the partnership.

LIST OF ATTACHMENTS

1. Quarterly Report: July 1-September 30, 2000, Indonesia: Establishing Democratic Civilian Control of the Military in Indonesia.”